



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

May 23, 2022

**REVIEW OF NOMINATING PETITION**

**PHILIP CAVANAGH**

Nonpartisan Candidate for 3rd Circuit Judge, Non-Incumbent Position

**NUMBER OF VALID SIGNATURES REQUIRED:** 4,000 signatures.

**TOTAL FILING:** 5,348 signatures.

**RESULT OF FACE REVIEW:** 3,816 facially valid signatures, 1,532 invalid signatures.

Total number of signatures filed		5,348
Not registered	<i>Less:</i>	107
Jurisdiction errors (no city in county known by name given by signer, dual jurisdiction entry, jurisdiction name given by signer does not align with address)	<i>Less:</i>	172
Date errors (no date given by signer, date of birth entered, or date given by signer is later than circulator's date of signing)	<i>Less:</i>	67
Address errors (no street address or rural route given)	<i>Less:</i>	10
Circulator errors (circulator did not sign or date petition, etc.)	<i>Less:</i>	50
Signature errors (no signature or incomplete signature)	<i>Less:</i>	1
Number of signatures on sheets submitted by fraudulent-petition circulators	<i>Less:</i>	1,125
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>3,816</b>

Staff reviewed each petition sheet submitted by Mr. Cavanagh. During that review, staff flagged each sheet which was signed by a fraudulent-petition circulator. For additional information on sheets submitted by fraudulent-petition circulators, see *Staff Report on Fraudulent Nominating Petitions*.

In total, staff's review of Mr. Cavanagh's petition sheets identified 1,532 invalid signatures and 3,816 facially valid signatures, which dropped him below the 4,000 threshold and rendered him ineligible for the ballot.

Unlike in other campaigns with fraudulent-petition circulators, which included the same circulators who submitted fraudulent petition sheets across drives, two individuals—Charlotte

Hanover and Violet Rose Evans—submitted all 1,125 fraudulent signatures to Mr. Cavanagh's campaign and did not submit to any other campaigns.

However, these petition sheets contained similar defects to those found in other fraudulent-petition circulator submissions, including the following:

Cavanagh petition sheet 347, line 1: voter's name is Sue, not Susan.

line 2: voter's name is Alicia but printed name indicates "Alica."

line 3: voter's name is Jeramie but signature and printed name indicate "Jeremy."

INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE

**NOMINATING PETITION**  
(COUNTYWIDE NONPARTISAN)

The "Countywide" Nonpartisan Petition form may be used by any nonpartisan candidate. Exceptions: the form may not be used by a candidate who seeks a school board position, intermediate school board position, community college trustee position, library board position or a district library board position.

PHILIP M. CAVANAGH (Name of Candidate)

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of Wayne and State of Michigan, nominate Philip M. Cavanagh as a candidate for the office of JUDGE 3rd Circuit Non Incumbent Regular term (Title of Office/ Term Expiration Date)

5060 Lakeview (Street Address or Rural Route) Detroit (City or Township) Second day of August, 2022

(District, if any) to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 347

**WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

	Signature	Printed Name	Street Address or Rural Route	Name of City or Township	Zip Code	DATE OF SIGNING Month Day Year
MC	<i>Susan Williams</i>	Susan Williams	3039 Garland St	Detroit	48214	3/19/22
MC	<i>Alica Owens</i>	Alica Owens	3522 Maryland Street	Detroit	48204	3/19/22
MC	<i>Jeremy Smith</i>	Jeremy Smith	4557 N. Redenbacher	Detroit	48211	3/19/22
MC	<i>Julius Young</i>	Julius Young	4103 Nottingham Road	Detroit	48224	3/19/22
MC	<i>Fred Prince</i>	Fred Prince	720 Seneca	Detroit	48207	3/19/22
MC	<i>Kent Hogue</i>	Kent Hogue	1877 Markhorough	Detroit	48245	3/19/22
MC	<i>Nathan Tully</i>	Nathan Tully	3185 Seneca St	Detroit	48214	3/19/22
MC	<i>Alicia Bell</i>	Alicia Bell	4000 Oakman Blvd	Detroit	48228	3/19/22
MC	<i>Jeramie Terrence</i>	Jeramie Terrence	4408 Hummel Ave	Detroit	48218	3/19/22
MC	<i>Cheyenne Cogan</i>	Cheyenne Cogan	4679 Ziegler	Detroit	48225	3/19/22

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR**

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition. The person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

☐ If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [✓] in the box provided, otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of the state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition filed executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

**CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**

*Violet Rose Edwards* (Signature of Circulator) (Date) \_\_\_\_\_

*Violet Rose Edwards* (Printed Name of Circulator)

*5060 Lakeview* (Complete Residence Address (Street and Number or Rural Route)) - (Do not enter a post office box)

*Detroit, MI 48204* (City or Township, State, Zip Code)

*Wayne* (County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

Form Approved by the Director of Elections, State of Michigan  
www.PetitionSystems.us (800) 85-12345 (1) 10/10 FORM #406

Cavanagh petition sheet 343, line 7: voter died in 2021.

<i>Alfred M. Tria</i>	430 Pineapple St	Westland	48186	3/28/22
		Westland	48154	3/28/22

Cavanagh petition sheet 267: alternating pens but distinctive slang and way of writing cursive "M" and "N" which is also present in the circulator's "M" in "Michigan."

INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE

# NOMINATING PETITION (COUNTYWIDE NONPARTISAN)

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of Wayne and State of Michigan, nominate PHILIP M. CAVANAGH (Name of Candidate)

5060 Lakeview Detroit on a candidate for the office of JUDGE 3rd Circuit Non Incumbent Regular term (City or Township) (Title of Office; Term Expiration Date)

(to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the Second day of August, 2022)

(District, if any) 267

**WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

Signature	Printed Name	Street Address or Rural Route	Name of City or Township	Zip Code	DATE OF SIGNING Month Day Year
<i>Matthew Keown</i>	Matthew Keown	45905 Bemis Rd	Belleville MI	48111	4 14 22
<i>Milt Olds</i>	Milt Olds	43181 Harris Road	Belleville	48111	4 14 22
<i>Luis Vazquez</i>	Luis Vazquez	6649 Fenton St.	Dearborn HTS.	48127	4 14 22
<i>Patricia Green</i>	Patricia Green	24353 Tamarack Trail	Southfield	48075	4 14 22
<i>Chenika Brown</i>	Chenika Brown	8135 Maxwell Ave	Warren	48089	4 14 22
<i>Nick Salton</i>	Nick Salton	504 Traubridge St.	Detroit	48202	4 14 22
<i>James Mitchell</i>	James Mitchell	3794 Taylor street.	Detroit	78206	4 14 22
<i>Edith Booser</i>	Edith Booser	20051 Vaughan St.	Detroit MI	48219	4 14 22
<i>Nathie Schaffer</i>	Nathie Schaffer	17495 Wayne Rd	Livonia	48152	4 14 22
<i>Amanda Littlefield</i>	Amanda Littlefield	12497 Prospect Ave	Warren MI	48089	4 14 22

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR**

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on this petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing this petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signor is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition. The person signing the petition was, at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

☐ If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross (X) or check mark (✓) in the box provided; otherwise each signature on this petition shall be invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a third official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

**CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**

*Charlotte A. Hanover* 4 14 22  
(Signature of Circulator) (Date)

Charlotte A. Hanover  
(Printed Name of Circulator)

2975 Western  
(Complete Residence Address (Street and Number or Rural Route)) - (Do not enter a post office box)

Detroit Michigan 48209  
(City or Township, State, Zip Code)

Wayne  
(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

Form Approved by the Director of Elections, State of Michigan  
www.michigan.gov/elections (03/05/2014) 01/01/15 FORM #406

**CHALLENGE:** Mr. Cavanagh's signatures were challenged by Jeffrey David Hillman. He alleged that 1,195 signatures across 132 petition sheets circulated by Violet Rose Edwards and Charlotte Hanover were fraudulent. However, the challenge was not processed because the circulators named above are the same ones the staff had already identified as fraudulent-petition circulators in its own review.

Mr. Hillman also alleged that a number of signers were not registered voters and that other signatures were invalid due to other defects, including date, jurisdictional, and signature defects. However, the challenge was not processed because based on the staff's face review, Mr. Cavanagh already did not have sufficient valid signatures to qualify for the ballot.

In his response to the challenge, Mr. Cavanagh argued that the challenge was technically invalid for reasons relating to whether the challenge to specific signatures appeared in the sworn text of the complaint.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Determine petition insufficient.